

Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group

Thursday, January 9, 2020 at 7:00 p.m.
Chesley Fire Hall
211 1st Ave N., Chesley, Ontario

MINUTES

A meeting of the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group was held on Thursday, January 9, 2020 at the Chesley Fire Hall.

Participating Municipalities Present:

Municipality	Name of Members in attendance
Arran-Elderslie	Doug Bell, Bill Palmer
Brockton	Steve Adams, Philip Englishman
Chatsworth	Scott Mackey
Georgian Bluffs	Carol Barfoot, Cathy Moore Coburn
Grey Highlands	Paul McQueen, Tom Allwood
Huron-Kinloss	Don Murray
Kincardine	Randy Roppel
West Lincoln	Harold Jonker

Participating Municipalities Absent:

Central Huron
Northern Bruce Peninsula

The following members of Staff were present:

Teresa Gowan

Arran-Elderslie

Secretary

Others in attendance were:

Warren Howard

North Perth

1. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Moved by: Tom Allwood

Seconded by: Carol Barfoot

That the Agenda for the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group meeting of January 9th, 2020 be received and adopted, as distributed by the Recording Secretary.

Carried

2. DECLARATION OF PECUNIARY INTERESTS:

No disclosures of pecuniary interests were made by the Committee.

2.a Election of Chair

Randy Roppel was nominated by Philip Englishman.

Randy Roppel declined this nomination citing he has been chair for two years and would like to see someone else be appointed for Chair.

Steve Adams was nominated by Scott Mackey seconded by Randy Roppel.

Steve Adams declined the nomination for Chair citing he had too many things on the go.

Paul McQueen was nominated by Philip Englishman.

Paul McQueen declined the nomination citing he is now Grey County Warden as well as Mayor of Grey Highlands, he has a lot going on.

Scott Mackey was nominated by Don Murray.

Scott Mackey declined the nomination.

Don Murray was nominated by Carol Barfoot and seconded by Scott Mackey.

Don Murray accepted the nomination.

Motion to close nominations moved by Paul McQueen, seconded by Harold Jonker.

The Committee voted by a show of hands to appoint Don Murray as Chair of the Committee for the year 2020.

Election of Vice-Chair

Steve Adams was nominated by Stewart Halliday, seconded by Philip Englishman.

Steve Adams accepted the nomination.

Motion to close nominations moved by Philip Englishman, seconded by Tom Allwood.

The Committee voted by a show of hands to appoint Steve Adams as Vice-Chair of the Committee for the year 2020.

The meeting continued with Don Murray as Chair and Steve Adams as Vice-Chair.

Don Murray thanked Randy Roppel for his work as Chair of the Committee for the last two years.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Moved by: Bill Palmer
Seconded by: Paul McQueen

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group adopt the minutes of the last Committee Meeting held November 14th, 2019, as circulated and as amended on pages 6, 7 and 8 with regard to Bill Palmer's comments and Steve Adams' comments and also on pages 4, 6 and 9.

Carried

4. DELEGATIONS

4.1 There were no delegations present at this meeting.

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

5.1 The Committee is awaiting comment from Minister Walker and Minister Thompson from their attendance at the Committee meeting on November 14, 2019.

Philip Englishman had raised an issue at the November 14th meeting regarding hydro rates for which he wanted an explanation from the Ministers and he has not received a response. Steve Adams said that the meeting the Ministers attended was prior to the announcement of the cancellation of contracts.

Bill Palmer commented that he had sent a personal letter to Minister Lisa Thompson and Minister Bill Walker (via their constituency offices) on December 9th regarding the decision letter sent by Minister Yurek to the chair of the North Stormont citizens group in which the Minister stated he had cancelled the ERT decision, and that the Nation Rise turbines would not be permitted to operate (as previously circulated to members of the MMWTWG) Bill noted he had thanked the Ministers for their presentation at the MMWTWG and had headed his note, "Thank You - You were Right - Things ARE Different."

Bill noted that he had received a response from Lisa Thompson's constituency office on December 10th which stated "Lisa responded and asked that I extend her appreciation to you for sending along your note."

Tom Allwood requested a copy of the email Bill Palmer received. Bill said he will forward that email to the members.

Scott Mackey suggesting sending an email to Minister Walker and Minister Thompson to state that the Committee very much appreciated their attendance at our meeting on November 14, 2019.

There was a comment that the NDP asked the Auditor General to review the decision on canceling of the Nation Rise project and the cost associated with the cancellation.

Bill Palmer noted that the Auditor General said she would review the decision. Bill also noted that since the request for a review came from the opposition party (NDP) the review would be a different type of review than if the request for an auditor review if it came from cabinet.

Paul McQueen mentioned that since 2009 when the Green Energy Act came into existence, the auditor should look at the cost in the last 10 years with increased hydro rates. The GEA projects have huge costs in infrastructure.

Bill Palmer suggested that the MMWTWG send an email to the Auditor General to review the cost of the Green Energy Act with regard to Paul's comments. Don Murray said that is a good idea.

Bill Palmer will put together an email for signature by the Chair, Don Murray, to be sent to the Auditor General by email and by regular mail.

Scott Mackey said it's a huge uphill battle. There's the climate crisis and people are looking to green energy to deal with climate change. We need to look at carbon footprint of the industrial wind turbines compared to the amount of power they provide. How do we get that information to the masses? It seems like every ad shows a wind turbine.

Steve Adams said the public really needs the facts not just the financial cost but the effects on roads, birds, bats, and people. Consider the amount of cement, re-bar and steel that is used to build the industrial wind turbines. Ninety-nine percent of the population are not aware of this information.

6. NEW BUSINESS

- 6.1 Review of Statement of Operations for 2019 prepared by the Treasurer for the Municipality of Arran-Elderslie. Don Murray said this Statement of Operations looks confusing Revenue \$4,400.00 and -\$400 to Bluewater?

Scott Mackey said something is not working out. They are not showing the \$400.00 membership fees.

Don Murray said we will defer this part of the Agenda to next meeting and we will ask Mark Davis and Bill Palmer to take it to the Municipality to get this Statement of Operations amended.

- 6.2 Review of 2020 annual fee for participating municipalities. The Chair, Don Murray, said this will be deferred to the next meeting, pending the amended 2019 Statement of Operations.

Harold Jonker said that it appears that we have enough money in the account that the Committee is comfortable in keeping the annual membership fee remain at \$400.00. Randy Roppel said that there is no reason to increase the membership fee. The rate of \$400.00 per year is a good deal.

A committee member asked what will the excess fund be used for? The Chair said in the past we have used the excess funds to pay for the bus tour and the cost to get the DVDs of the bus tour. The Chair said we are very lucky to have Bill Palmer and Warren Howard working on items and perhaps we could spend some of the excess funds to bring other speakers to address the Committee. The Chair said that the excess funds could also be used if one member municipality needs assistance with a wind turbine issue, we could use those funds to help.

Scott Mackey said maybe we should revisit the matter of excess funds each November so the Committee could have a discussion in November what the excess funds will be used for.

Doug Bell said that maybe we could get the Treasurer's report twice a year.

The Chair said that the annual invoices get paid by June, so for now we will leave the annual fee at \$400.00 for the 2020 year.

Tom Allwood asked to get a new Statement of Operations before we send the invoices out to municipalities.

Moved by: Paul McQueen
Seconded by: Scott Mackey

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group for the year 2020, send out invoices to the member municipalities for the amount of \$400.00 to be included with a Statement of Operations for the year ended December 31, 2019.

Carried

- 6.3 Review of annual payment to the Chesley Fire Department for rental of meeting hall. The Committee has in the past paid the Chesley Fire Department an annual donation of \$500.00 for the use of the fire hall meeting room to hold our meetings.

Randy Roppel said that is cheap rent for a meeting hall, even if we have only six meetings in a year. Scott Mackey said the Fire Chief decides where this donation is applied.

Moved by: Doug Bell
Seconded by: Carol Barfoot

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group donate \$500.00 annual fee (to Chesley Fire Department) for use of the Chesley Fire Hall for purposes of committee meetings in year 2020.

Carried

- 6.4 Review of Recording Secretary's wage. There was a discussion on the cost of living and the rate of increases various municipalities are considering for their staff for the year 2020.

Randy Roppel said because the Committee is under the Arran-Elderslie's by-laws, how much of an increase is Arran-Elderslie considering for their staff? Doug Bell said that we are using 1.7% increase for Arran-Elderslie for 2020.

Scott Mackey said the annual membership rate was \$400.00 last year. The annual membership a few years ago was \$800.00. If you look at any increase, it should be in line with every membership municipality. The average is between 1.6% and 2.0%

Moved by: Randy Roppel
Seconded by: Scott Mackey

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group pay our Recording Secretary a 2% increase in her wage for 2020.

Carried

- 6.5 Randy Roppel, member for Kincardine, paid Bill Palmer the annual stipend of \$2.00 as a retainer for his work as a Professional Engineer and submitting reports to the Committee. The Chair thanked Bill Palmer for all his work over the last year.
- 6.6 Cancellation of Nation Rise Wind Farm IWT project. Warren Howard briefed the Committee on the Decision by Minister Jeff Yurek, Minister of Environment, Conservation and Parks, dated December 4, 2019. The appeal was broad based and based on public interest which has resulted in the cancellation of the Nation Rise Wind Farm project based on the degree of harm to the local bat species. Currently the construction has stopped, but the proponent has the right to appeal the Decision until February 14, 2020.

Warren mentioned that the Huron County Health Unit wind study was good but disappointing as there were only 72 participants, which was too small of a sample to result in any finite conclusions.

Warren Howard mentioned that the North Kent IWT project has a well water situation. The local people are accusing the wind farm project of destroying wells. The Province has appointed an independent commission to look into the issue and to report back. The independent commission will be testing water and looking for metals in the water. The Government is taking action on this. Currently the local people are bringing in tanks of water for drinking as they are not using well water. The continuous pile driving continuously stirs up the water. There are 20 houses that have no water. The reason that there is a third party testing of the water, is that the Ministry of the Environment is not trusted by the people.

- 6.7 Massive wind turbine crashes in New York falling onto a car. This story appeared online and was circulated to the members. One comment was that the wind turbine that was erected on the top of a building was only a small wind turbine and is not the same size as the IWTs in our area.

7. FOR INFORMATION

- 7.1 Warren Howard asked if there were any members of the Committee attending the ROMA (Rural Ontario Municipal Association) conference?

Randy Roppel said that there is one member going from Kincardine.
Don Murray said that the Mayor of Huron-Kinloss will be attending.

Warren Howard mentioned that if there are no questions raised regarding IWTs, then it is considered not an issue. There are some questions that could be raised in the bear pit, such as zoning by-laws, changing regulations and set backs.

Don Murray said that he was going to attend the conference but that since Huron-Kinloss is working on getting a new hospital in Kincardine, he would get shot down if he raised any IWT issues.

Harold Jonker said that he is not going to the conference, but that their municipality is also working on getting a new hospital in the West Lincoln area.

Steve Adams asked Harold Jonker how long does it take for him to attend the Committee meeting? Harold replied that it takes him three hours in travel time. Harold Jonker said that in West Lincoln the IWTs are the biggest, they are huge and above the tree line. Around his home there are 16 lights flashing at the top of the IWTs. There has been some issues

regarding dust when they were being built. Personally, Harold doesn't have any effects from the IWTs.

Harold Jonker said that the IWTs in Bruce County sound like a jet plane, but the ones in West Lincoln are quiet, except when the construction is going on. Their municipality accepted \$800,000 in funds from the wind developers but they can only spend this money on replacing trees that they cut down. All the distribution lines are above ground on galvanized poles in the ditches. The distribution lines issue distracted the people from the IWTs. There are 77 IWTs in West Lincoln. Harold said that their area is more densely populated than this area and the West Lincoln IWTs have been up for 3 or 4 years.

Bill Palmer said that he knows of one family in West Lincoln who had to move out due to the IWTs, the family was also close to the transformer station.

Harold Jonker said he lives across a field from an IWT and he has never heard it. Outside Harold's door he can count 20 IWTs.

8. DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING

The next meeting date is scheduled for Thursday, March 12, 2020, at 7:00 p.m. at the Chesley Fire Hall, 211 1st Ave. N., Chesley ON N0G 1L0.

9. RESOLUTION TO MOVE INTO CLOSED SESSION AND GENERAL NATURE THEREOF (includes appointed Councillor(s) and citizen appointee)

Not Required.

10. RESOLUTION TO RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

Not Required.

11. ADOPTION OF RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING FROM CLOSED SESSION (if any)

None.

12. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by: Philip Englishman
Seconded by: Steve Adams

That the meeting be adjourned to the call of the Chair.
The meeting was adjourned at 8:40 p.m.

Carried

Original Signed by

Don Murray, Chair

Original Signed by

Teresa Gowan, Recording Secretary