

Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group

Thursday, February 14, 2019 at 7:00 p.m.
Chesley Fire Hall
211 1st Ave N., Chesley, Ontario

MINUTES

A meeting of the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group was held on Thursday, February 14, 2019 at the Chesley Fire Hall.

Participating Municipalities Present:

Municipality	Name of Members in attendance
Arran-Elderslie	Mark Davis, Doug Bell, Bill Palmer
Brockton	Steve Adams, Philip Englishman
Chatsworth	Scott Mackey, Elizabeth Thompson
Georgian Bluffs	Carol Barfoot, Cathy Moore Coburn
Grey Highlands	Tom Allwood, Stewart Halliday
Huron-Kinloss	Don Murray
Kincardine	Randy Roppel
Northern Bruce Peninsula	Debbie Myles, James Mielhausen, Linda Weatherhead

Participating Municipalities Absent:

Central Huron
West Lincoln

The following members of Staff were present:

Teresa Gowan Arran-Elderslie Secretary

Others in attendance were:

Warren Howard North Perth

The Chair, Randy Roppel, opened the meeting and welcomed the new members to the Committee and also welcomed the returning members to the Committee. The Chair asked each member to introduce themselves to the Committee.

1. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Moved by: Mark Davis

Seconded by: Tom Allwood

That the Agenda for the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group meeting of February 14, 2019 be received and adopted, as distributed by the Recording Secretary. **Carried**

1.(a) ELECTION OF CHAIR

Nominations for Chair of the Committee for 2019 were opened.

Philip Englishman nominated Randy Roppel for Chair.

Seconded by Steve Adams

Randy Roppel agreed to let his name stand for election to Chair for 2019.

It was moved and seconded that nominations for Chair be closed.

Carried

A show of hands vote was conducted to elect Randy Roppel as Chair of the Committee for 2019.

Carried

Nominations for Vice-Chair of the Committee for 2019 were opened.

Steve Adams nominated Stewart Halliday for Vice-Chair

Stewart Halliday declined the nomination as he is not an elected official but he is waiting to be approved by the Council of Grey Highlands as an appointed citizen representative.

Tom Allwood stated that appointment of Stewart Halliday as appointed citizen representative for Grey Highlands should occur at the next Grey Highlands Council meeting.

Scott Mackey requested that the Terms of Reference be reviewed to determine whether Stewart Halliday could be elected as Vice-Chair if Stewart is appointed as a citizen representative.

Stewart Halliday said he would be willing to accept the Vice-Chair position of the Committee for 2019 if the Terms of Reference determines that an appointed citizen representative can hold the position of Vice-Chair.

Carol Barfoot requested that the Recording Secretary check the Terms of Reference and determine whether it allows for an appointed citizen representative to hold the position of Vice-Chair, and if the determination is allowed, to elect Stewart Halliday as Vice-Chair of the Committee for 2019 retroactively, to be in effect as of tonight's meeting.

Moved by: Steve Adams

Seconded by: Scott Mackey

That nominations for Vice-Chair be closed.

Carried

Randy Roppel for the Municipality of Kincardine paid the annual amount of \$2.00 as contract rate to Bill Palmer, Professional Engineer for his role as Technical Advisor to the Committee.

2. DECLARATION OF PECUNIARY INTERESTS:

No disclosures of pecuniary interests were made by the Committee.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Moved by: Doug Bell

Seconded by: Carol Barfoot

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group adopt the minutes of the last Committee Meeting held November 8th 2018, as circulated.

Carried

4. DELEGATIONS

4.1 Mark Davis welcomed the new members and provided the new members with a background of the Committee. The Committee is either 9 or 10 years old. Grey Highlands hosted the first Committee meeting in 2010. The Committee started when the Ontario Government brought in the Green Energy Act in 2009 which brought a lot of concern for municipalities as the Act took away the rights of the municipalities to decline green energy projects like Industrial Wind Turbines (IWTs). Some local municipalities got together and formed this Committee to deal with wind developers who were coming into the rural areas to install Industrial Wind Turbines. The Committee has had meetings and events in Toronto as well as protests.

Mark said that members of the Committee have met a lot of people, like Sherri Lange who started NA-PAW (North American Platform Against Wind Power). She is an influential lady and very knowledgeable.

Bill Palmer has been a tremendous help to the Committee, he is a Professional Engineer focusing on acoustics and has provided this Committee with so much technical information on sound and acoustics as it relates to Industrial Wind Turbines.

Mark mentioned that both he and Bill Palmer spoke at the Good Roads Conference in Toronto. The Committee has worked hard to help municipalities open their eyes to the important issues regarding Industrial Wind Turbines.

Most important for this Committee is to help people who become ill because of the Industrial Wind Turbines near their homes and farmers who can't continue to farm due to the effects of the IWTs. These people are not getting a lot of help from the government.

In June 2016 the Committee organized a bus tour of areas most affected by Industrial Wind Turbines which was an eye-opening experience for some representatives of municipalities who do not have Industrial Wind Turbines in their municipalities. There was one delegate from Meaford who got very ill during the bus tour because of the effects of the wind turbines. There was a DVD made of the tour and we will provide a copy to the new members to view.

Dr. Hazel Lynn, the Chief Medical Officer of Health for the Grey-Bruce Health Unit did a study with Dr. Ian Arra which stated that between 12% and 15% of people living near Industrial Wind Turbines are negatively affected by the wind turbines.

Some municipalities brought in by-laws to deal with Industrial Wind Turbines.

Mark suggest that maybe this summer the Committee could organize another tour for the new members.

The Chair mentioned that the people who have been affected by IWTs and how they have been treated has been horrible. We, as elected officials have the responsibility to fight for our citizens. We look forward to your input.

- 4.2 Warren Howard presented a Powerpoint presentation on Changes to Municipal Planning Role in Renewable Energy Projects. Warren reviewed the generation capacity in Ontario and noted that the Ontario generation system is 95% carbon emission free. Storage for wind generation is still an expensive dream. The wind industry is changing, they are planning to reconfigure projects with fewer but larger turbines. Warren reviewed Ontario's regulatory framework as to noise levels, setbacks and that the existing rules are not sufficient to protect residents' health. The current Provincial Government is facing a range of serious issues that are demanding attention. People want the government to get rid of contracts.

The Provincial Government is returning planning authority for renewable energy projects to municipalities. The Green Energy Repeal Act was approved in mid-December, comments were due January 18, 2019, however due to the Christmas season and council transitions from the municipal election in October, there was limited response.

The impact of the Green Energy Act Repeal made amendments to the Planning Act and to the Electricity Act. Warren's presentation suggested proposals to municipalities to consider permitted land use, advice to public, application of zoning by-laws, how to demonstrate demand for electricity projects, and new project assessments.

In Warren's presentation, he lists suggestions for municipal action to consider by municipal councils is to review Official Plan and zoning by-laws.

Warren Howard's presentation is attached to these minutes which can be provided to the local Councils for consideration. Warren Howard can be contacted for further information at howardwarr@aol.com

- 4.3 Bill Palmer showed a video from Germany about Industrial Wind Turbines and infrasound originally shown on German Television ZDFmediathek. Bill introduced the video and said that this is a really interesting video. It is looking at the scientific response. The difficulty is proving that someone is going to be bothered.

Bill stated that when someone comes and says "I'm bothered" we need to respect that.

The Chair thanked Bill for his presentation. The Chair remarked that we have had people who have appeared at this Committee who have suffered from the effects of IWTs. Some people don't realize that what they are experiencing are symptoms of IWTs.

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

- 5.1 There was a follow-up of the list of names to be appointed to proposed working group as suggested by Bill Walker, MPP Bruce-Grey-Owen Sound and Lisa Thompson MPP Huron-Bruce. The list of names that the Committee had put together was:

Randy Roppel
Bill Palmer
Mark Davis
Stewart Halliday
Steve Adams

The Recording Secretary stated that John McPhee from Lisa Thompson's office sent an email today stating that Lisa Thompson is currently discussing creating a bigger working group on IWTs with Ministers Rod Phillips (Minister of the Environment) and Greg Rickford (Minister of Energy) as well as Bill Walker MPP (Minister of Government and Consumer Services). Lisa Thompson is hoping to get some local officials involved in the discussion with the Ministers soon. Lisa will let our Committee know as soon as more concrete plans are in place.

There was some discussion in the Committee as to whether to push for more information and answers from both Lisa Thompson and Bill Walker or to invite the Ministers to a Committee meeting.

Some Committee members stated that we should wait and give Lisa Thompson and other members of the Government some time to do their work.

Bill Palmer stated that he will be removing his name from the list for a while due to some unforeseen circumstances. Bill Palmer advised Bill Walker and Lisa Thompson that he would be removing his name from the list.

Randy Roppel, the Chair, stated that the Committee will review this list at next Committee meeting on April 11, 2019.

It was suggested that an email be sent to John McPhee at Lisa Thompson's office stating that while the Committee understands that Lisa has a lot of pressures on her right now, the Committee is available to work with her on the proposed working group when it comes together.

Mark Davis said that Bill Walker contacted him this week and Mark advised him that the Committee is willing to talk and work with them on the proposed working group.

The Chair thanked Mark for giving an update and stated that the Committee is certainly ready and willing to work with them on this proposed working group.

6. NEW BUSINESS

6.1 There was a review of the Municipal Election results as it pertains to members of the Committee. The Chair stated that there are some members who will be coming back to represent their municipalities and some who will not be coming back. The municipalities who have unfortunately withdrawn from the Committee are Bluewater, Meaford, South Bruce Peninsula, Wainfleet and West Grey.

For the members who will not be coming back, The Chair thanked them for the years of service they provided to the Committee.

The Chair said he looks forward to working with the returning members and the new appointed members.

There was a discussion on how the Committee should honour the members of the Committee who have passed, such as Dave Colling, and recently Carol Lawrence. There was a discussion a while ago about putting up a plaque for Dave Colling somewhere. Don Murray from Huron-Kinloss stated that Dave Colling passed 5 years ago, perhaps the time for honouring him has passed.

Philip Englishman stated that he is a personal friend of the family of Carol Lawrence, who recently passed and they suggested a contribution to the Southampton nursing home where Carol received excellent care.

There was a comment stating that the funds held by the Committee is taxpayer money and that using the funds this way would be up to each municipality.

Mark Davis said that the Municipality of Arran-Elderslie has a policy in place that if a person who has made a significant role in the Municipality

passes away Council will make a \$50.00 donation in memory of that person to the charitable place as determined by the family.

Moved by: Mark Davis

Seconded by: Tom Allwood

that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group make a donation in honour of Carol Lawrence to one of the charities at the family's choice in the amount of \$50.00 as per the Arran-Elderslie Procedural By-law.

Carried

Philip Englishman stated he is a friend of the family of Carol Lawrence and he will check with them as to their wishes where the donation be sent.

7. FOR INFORMATION

7.1 The Chair asked for a review of the Recording Secretary's increase for 2019, and noting that the Committee will be meeting every second month. It was decided that the Statement of Operations which was received late today will be circulated to the members and this matter will be discussed at the next meeting.

7.2 With regard to the usage of the Chesley Fire Hall for our meetings,

Moved by: Mark Davis

Seconded by: Scott Mackey

That the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group direct staff to give a cheque to the Chesley Fire Department in the amount of \$500.00 for the use of the Fire Hall for our 2019 meetings.

Carried

8. DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT COMMITTEE MEETING

The next meeting date is scheduled for Thursday, April 11, 2019, at 7:00 p.m. at the Chesley Fire Hall, 211 1st Ave. N., Chesley ON N0G 1L0.

9. RESOLUTION TO MOVE INTO CLOSED SESSION AND GENERAL NATURE THEREOF (includes appointed Councillor(s) and citizen appointee)

Not Required

10. RESOLUTION TO RECONVENE IN OPEN SESSION

Not Required

11. ADOPTION OF RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING FROM CLOSED SESSION (if any)

None

12. ADJOURNMENT

Moved by: Tom Allwood

Seconded by: James Mielhausen

That the meeting be adjourned to the call of the Chair.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Carried

Original Signed by

Randy Roppel, Chair

Original Signed by

Teresa Gowan, Recording Secretary

Changes to Municipal Planning Role in Renewable Energy Projects

Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine
Working Group

February 14, 2019

Reality Check

- **Sufficient generation capacity until 2035**
 - Surplus narrows when Darlington is being refurbished
 - Intermittent wind/solar will not replace nuclear
 - IESO has identified short term alternatives
- **Ontario generation system is 95% carbon emission free**
 - Based on nuclear and hydro
 - Adding more intermittent wind/solar increases carbon emissions due to need for gas plant back up
- **Storage is still an expensive dream**
 - Tesla built 100MW of storage in Australia – \$90 million
 - Supplies 70MW for only 10 minutes with the other 30MW providing 3 hours of power.

Wind Industry is Changing

- **Claims to be “Cheapest” Source of Electricity**
 - Alberta RFP bids averaged 3.7 cents vs. RFP 8.59 cents
 - 3.0 cents carbon tax subsidy available for renewables
- **Assume no new contracts from a PC government**
- **Replaced by New Types of Projects**
 - Repowering projects
 - Aging equipment; accelerated capital write-offs
 - Reconfigure projects with fewer but larger turbines
 - Create higher nameplate capacity with reduced costs
 - Industries wanting “Green” electricity
 - Local investors interested in “Green” initiatives

Ontario's Regulatory Framework

Noise Levels – 40 d B(A)

- Measures “average” audible noise outside homes
- Level above recommended new WHO turbine noise limit
- Health Canada – problems start at 35 dB(A)
- Council of Canadian Academies - dB(A) not correct tool

Setbacks – 550 metres to centre of homes

- Distance needed to limit audible noise to 40 d B(A)
- Germany's Bavaria -10 X height – about 2,000 metres

Setbacks – Blade length plus 10 metres to roads, property lines

- Failures show separation insufficient to protect from blade failure, ice throw

Existing rules are not sufficient to protect residents' health.

Ontario Wind Project Status

Operating Projects - 2,441 turbines in 82 projects

- Nameplate Output - 5,470 MW; Effective Output - 1,586 MW
- Annual Cost – Contracts - \$1,863M; Displaced electricity - \$970M
- Total Average Cost per Household - \$590
- Wind represents 14% of generation costs vs. 7% of output

“Key Deliverable Milestones” Not Achieved

- **Contracts cancelled** – White Pines, Strong Breeze, Otter Creek, Eastern Fields plus 750 small projects.

“Key Deliverable Milestones” Achieved

- **Under Construction** – Henvey Inlet; Romney Wind
- **Being Appealed** – Nation Rise
 - ERT appeal rejected; now appealed to Minister Phillips
 - Appeal based on “public interest” – benefit of electricity generated vs. potential for environmental impact.
 - Lower standard than ERT ‘serious and irreversible harm’

Current Provincial Government

- **“Facing a range of serious issues demanding attention”**
 - Fiscal situation, economic growth
 - Health Care – cost and wait times
 - Carbon tax/Climate Change Plan
- **Interest in getting rid of turbine contracts but ...**
 - Many see it as hydro cost issue; no focus on impact on people
 - Moving cautiously because of reaction to White Pines
 - Looking for pathways to avoid legal challenges
- **Entrenched bureaucracy**
- **Residents’ complaints provide opportunity**
 - Noise Audit protocol – Classic Red Tape
 - years of endless testing; no action
 - REA’s require response to complaints

Actions on Planning Authority

- Provincial government is returning planning authority for renewable energy projects to municipalities.
 - Measures affect all types of renewables
- Green Energy Repeal Act approved in mid-December.
- Three sets of regulation changes posted for comment on December 4; comments were due Jan 18:
 - ERO # 013-3800 – Demonstrating Demand
 - ERO # 013-4040 – Municipal Planning Authorities
 - ERO # 013-4265 – Transition – Planning Act
- Limited municipal response
 - Council transitions/Christmas season

Impact of Green Energy Act Repeal

Amendments Made to Planning Act

- Municipal zoning decisions that authorize or refuse renewable energy undertakings cannot be appealed.

Amendments made to Electricity Act

- Municipal by-laws can still be declared inoperative for “designated projects”.
- Roof-top solar projects, clotheslines and ground source heat pumps designated in Regulation 508/18.

Changes to Municipal Planning

Proposal: Confirming Permitted Land Use

- Written confirmation from municipal authorities that use of land not prohibited by zoning by-law.

Comment

- *Recommend using a 'municipal support' resolution approved by Council as many current planning documents do not reflect municipal views.*
- *Restrictions may be in Official Plan; not zoning by-law*
- *Plan amendment process requires considerable time.*

Changes to Municipal Planning (cont'd)

Proposal: Advice to Public

- Developers not required to make municipal confirmation available to public before final public meeting.

Comment:

- *Municipal consultations should be disclosed to the public immediately.*

Changes to Municipal Planning (cont'd)

Proposal: Application of Zoning By-laws

- By-laws would only apply to:
 - Applications for new projects (#013-4040)
 - Changes to existing project locations (#013-4040)
 - Geographic expansion of project (#013-4265)

Comment:

- *Existing set-backs not sufficient to protect health; existing locations should not be grandfathered.*
- *New municipal zoning by-laws should apply to repowering of turbine projects or replacement of components.*
- *Resolution of complaints also required for approval of project changes.*

Prove Need for Electricity

Proposal: How to Demonstrate Demand

- Agreement to purchase by government
- Agreement to purchase by other users
- Generate for own use
- Net-metering agreement
- Proposal to sell on open market

Comment

- *Assessment should consider net impact across the whole grid.*
- *Ensure that pricing arrangements do not increase Global Adjustment charges or hydro costs for other users.*
- *Local renewable generation where it is used.*

Prove Need for Electricity (cont'd)

Proposal: New Project Assessment

- Use current Renewable Energy Approval process to evaluate new projects.

Comment

- *Need to increase set-backs to protect health*
- *Expand opportunities for municipal input*
- *Include meaningful public consultation*
- *Expand scope of appeals and standards for successful appeal in Environmental Protection Act.*

Suggestions for Municipal Action

Comment on Proposals

Request Provincial Actions

- *Request changes to Provincial Policy Statement to align with new municipal powers. (ERO # 013-4040)*
- *Revisions to provincial set-back guidelines needed to reflect learning from existing projects.*
- *Request provincial fire safety standards for turbines & rooftop solar. (ERO #013-3800)*

Review Official Plan/Zoning By-law

- *Remove support for wind turbine projects from Official Plan.*
- *Prohibit use of prime agricultural land for turbines.*
- *Establish set-backs for wind turbines in zoning by-law.*
 - *Leverage example from Bavaria – 10 times height.*

Summary

- Proposals assume that zoning by-laws effective in regulating for wind turbines.
- Proposed regulations suggest a narrow role and do not acknowledge current problems
- Providing comments important even though deadline has passed.
- Include a request action to address problems with operating projects.
- Review of Official Plan/zoning by-laws appropriate now given likely new municipal role.

Appendix 1:

Turbines Create Adverse Effects

- Environment Ministry received 4,562 complaints between 2006 - 2016
- Effects linked to the full range of noise emissions
 - Audible noise interferes with activities/interrupts sleep.
 - Buildings vibrating; feel pulsing sensations linked to infrasound/low frequency noise.
- Headaches, nausea, dizziness, ringing in the ears
- Disorienting shadow flicker/strobe effect is a risk to safety
- Forced to leave home to get relief from symptoms
- **35% of complaints report health issues**

Appendix 2:

Wind Turbine Noise Primer

Types of Noise	Definition	How Perceived	Health Effects
Audible Noise	20 Hz to 20,000 Hz	Normal Hearing	Annoyance* Sleep disturbance
Low Frequency Noise	20 Hz to 160 Hz	Normal Hearing	Annoyance* Sleep disturbance
Infrasound	Below 20 Hz	Felt by whole body	Sleep disturbance Pressure in ears Tinnitus Headache Nausea Dizziness

*Note: Annoyance is used as the medical term meaning chronic stress. Chronic sleep disturbance is tied to a wide range of medical conditions.